

Appendix S: Policy Appraisal Matrices - Templates

Appraising Options (Stage B2)

We plan to carry out appraisals in separate sessions covering individual topics. We will then draw together the results into a summary table similar to that shown on the right. Each option will be appraised against the 18 sustainability objectives as a whole (*considering sub questions*). This will involve assigning each option a positive and negative impact “score”; which allows multiple impacts to be identified for each option. We believe this is more realistic than an approach that simply defines impacts in terms of only positive or negative.

	Option 1:		Option 2:		Option 3:		Option 4:	
	Impact	Description of impacts / comments	Impact	Description of impacts / comments	Impact	Description of impacts / comments	Impact	Description of impacts / comments
1. Biodiversity	+		+		+		-	
2. Air	+		+		+		-	
3. Soil and minerals	+		+		+		-	

Carrying out the appraisal with this methodology will also allow us to present the results in a way that illustrates the strengths and weaknesses of each option in terms of sustainability clearly. For example, in the chart below, the impact of option 1 on the objective 18 is a major negative, but there are some minor positives too.

Example - Option 1 - Summary of sustainability scores

+																	
+			+	+	+	+	+		+								
+			+	+	+	?	+		+								
1. Biodiversity	2. Air	3. Soil	4. water	5. landscape & countryside	6. Buildings	7. Community safety	8. Neighbourhood quality	9. Waste	10. Health	11. Leisure	12. Housing	13. Education	14. Community	15. Energy	16. Transport	17. Sustainable economy	18. Economy & employment
			-	-	-	?					-	-	-	-	-	-	
			-	-	-						-	-	-	-	-	-	

- Very major / important positive impact
- Major positive impact
- moderate - major positive impact
- moderate positive impact
- minor positive impact

- no fill = negligible impact / not relevant
- ? = unknown

- minor negative impact
- moderate negative impact
- moderate - major negative impact
- major negative impact
- very major / important negative impact