

Overview & Scrutiny

Select Committee N^o. 3

*The Effectiveness of CCTV
within the
Wigan Borough*

Draft Report

*Select Committee Chairman
Councillor Mark Aldred*

Contents

1. Executive Summary	Page 1
2. Background	Page 5
3. Scope, Aims and Objectives	Page 7
4. Methodology	Page 8
5. Research Findings	Page 9
6. Conclusions	Page 36
7. Proposed Recommendations	Page 37
Appendix A	

Executive Summary

The installation of Close Circuit Television (CCTV) commenced in Wigan in the early 1990's on the Miry Lane Industrial Estate funded by a City Challenge project. Since this time CCTV has been installed in Wigan, Leigh, Ashton, Atherton, Hindley, Golborne and Tyldesley town centres along with crime hotspots at Borsdane Precinct and Smithy Green.

There are now in excess of 500 cameras that are transmitted to the CCTV Control Room.

The scope of the review was to include all cameras that are linked to the Council's Control Room and the use of the Swift Rapid Deployment Cameras.

The aims of the review were to study the effectiveness of CCTV within Wigan by examining the costs, benefits and processes involved in providing the service. To fully appreciate the effectiveness of CCTV, the Select Committee consulted with a number of stakeholders and considered relevant research.

The Select Committee agreed the following objectives:

- To quantify the costs of continuing the service at current and increased levels.
- To identify beneficiaries of and financial contributors to the service.
- To understand the extent of CCTV coverage and occurrence of crime by type and frequency within the borough.
- To examine existing key processes and evaluate their effectiveness both internally and externally.
- To identify good practice wherever it may exist.

Main Findings

1. The cost to the Council of providing this service has increased since its introduction and this is expected to continue, even if the current levels of service remain the same. There appears to be a clear need to determine the monitoring hours required for it to remain effective without increased salary costs. Finding replacement funding to cover salaries was not within the remit of this review but failure to do so now will significantly affect the effectiveness of the service.
2. There are numerous beneficiaries of the service but few make any specific financial contribution. The public is generally unaware that they are receiving this service. Where contributions are received, this is not linked to the actual cost being incurred. A full list of beneficiaries and contributors are listed within the main body of the report.
3. Cameras have been primarily located around town centres where they are useful to both the day and night environments. They have also been used to target hot spot areas. Throughout the review, there is the suggestion that **time related** hot spots, rather than **geographical** hot spots should become the focus of attention. Unfortunately, it is difficult to draw conclusions on the type and frequency of crime because of the confidentiality of the Tactical Assessment Document that is referred to within the report.
4. It is considered that police presence and/or a police radio in the Control Room should be pursued to improve the current service together with awareness raising for police officers. Identifying the effectiveness of CCTV has been difficult to demonstrate and the absence of a formalised performance reporting system for 2003/2004 has proved to be a hindrance. However, prior to financial year 2003/2004 evidence shows improved effectiveness (see paragraph 6.3.1 and 7.6.2).

5. Whilst researched, it was found that Wigan and Leigh Housing Ltd Concierge Scheme, that benefits from CCTV provision, has different objectives to those of the CCTV Control Room, making a joint operation unlikely. Manchester City Centre CCTV Control Room is a particularly good example of partnership working both to obtain funding and in the provision of the service.
6. The Home Office has invested significant funds into CCTV over the past few years and this document reflects this. CCTV is obviously viewed as one effective tool to reduce crime and disorder.

Proposed Main Recommendations

R1. Enhance partnership working. Although there are good relationships with the Police, this review has identified that the systems and processes in place could be further improved to directly impact on the effectiveness of the CCTV service. It is recommended that there is continued joint working to complete the tasks identified within the Action Plan. These discussions to include arrangements to secure guaranteed police presence in the Control Room during hours of greatest need.

R2. Develop a Business Plan, which reviews existing and future funding sources of income. Develop a clear criterion for expansion, which is properly communicated to major stakeholders. This will include the examination of proposals that the shop/pub watch community contribute together with greater resource input from the police. The plan should form part of the Security Service Plan.

R3. Further development of the performance management system to both evidence effectiveness and to assist the business planning process. The performance management framework in place needs to be developed further in order that it can provide accurate and timely information about effectiveness and will assist in future business planning activity.

R4. Increase public awareness of the existence and effectiveness of CCTV in the borough. This will lead to an added sense of security to the public and act as a deterrent to the criminal fraternity.

1. Background of CCTV Provision in Wigan

1.1 In the early 1990's, CCTV was installed on the Miry Lane Industrial Estate as part of a City Challenge project. In 1996/1997, CCTV was installed in Wigan and Leigh Town Centres. Since that date, CCTV coverage has extended into Ashton in Makerfield, Atherton, Hindley, Golborne and Tyldesley Town Centres. Other sites that have CCTV and are not town centre locations but which were identified as crime hot spots are Mornington School / Borsdane Precinct and Smithy Green, Ince. All the CCTV installations listed are the responsibility of the Council.

1.2 There are also CCTV cameras at Wigan Bus Station that are monitored by the Council, at the request of Greater Manchester Passenger Transport Executive, but the Council didn't originally install these.

1.3 Further installations took place at Norley Hall (15 cameras on 4th October 2004) and others are planned along the Canal Towpath within the near future (on behalf of British Waterways).

1.4 There are now 520 camera images that can be transmitted to the CCTV Control Room compared with 240 camera images in May 2001. This represents an increase of nearly 120% in the past two and a half years. Wigan and Leigh Housing Limited (WALH) owns, maintains and operates 120 of the 520 cameras that are located in and around the flats at Scholes as part of the Concierge Scheme. However, the Control Room has remote access to these cameras if and when it is required.

1.5 There are also eight Swift Rapid Deployment Cameras included in the overall figure. These cameras are mobile units used for overt and covert operations. For example, CCTV coverage at high profile football matches at the JJB stadium.

1.6 The growth in CCTV has involved significant capital investment of more than £3 million, most of which has been funded by Home Office CCTV grants. However, the Home Office grants do not fund the running costs of CCTV i.e. maintenance, repairs, replacement or staffing. This is funded by the Council through its' revenue account and amounts to circa 300k.

1.7 Wigan is seen as a leader in CCTV systems. In an article in the CCTV Image magazine, February 2003, *“the CCTV system at Wigan proudly proclaims its leadership in CCTV, as exemplified by its four plus one camera configuration, being the first Council CCTV Control Room to achieve NACOSS approval and being a pioneer in the use of rear projection flat screen monitors to replace traditional CRT monitor walls.”*

2. Scope, Aims and Objectives of the Review

2.1 The review commenced on the 13th January 2004 at which time the scope; aims and objectives of the review were agreed.

2.2 The scope of the review was to include all cameras that are linked to the Council's Control Room and the use of the Swift Rapid Deployment Cameras.

2.3 The aims of the review were to study the effectiveness of CCTV within Wigan by examining the costs, benefits and processes involved in providing the service. To fully appreciate the effectiveness of CCTV, the Select Committee consulted with a number of stakeholders and considered relevant research.

The Select Committee agreed the following objectives:

- **To quantify the costs of continuing the service at current and increased levels.**
- **To identify beneficiaries of and financial contributors to the service.**
- **To understand the extent of CCTV coverage and occurrence of crime by type and frequency within the borough.**
- **To examine existing key processes and evaluate their effectiveness both internally and externally.**
- **To identify good practice wherever it may exist.**

3. Methodology

3.1 The methodology used within the review is critical in obtaining the information required that will assist an informed view and enable recommendations to be made. Listed below are the preferred methods of this Select Committee:

- **Interviews** were held with various stakeholders. These included Greater Manchester Police and staff within the CCTV Control Room.

- **Visits to other CCTV Control Rooms**
Visits were undertaken to CCTV Control Rooms at Wigan and Leigh Housing Ltd Concierge Scheme and Manchester City Centre CCTV Control Room to gain comparison in service provision.

- **Research**
Research of reports and web sites included the Home Office web site, past reports from CCTV Section and Community Safety Panel.

- **Meetings**
Regular meetings were conducted with Select Committee 3 and various stakeholders were invited to interview.

4. Objective 1.

To quantify the costs of continuing the service at current and increased levels.

4.1 Approach

4.1.1 The information available at the commencement of the review indicated that the majority of capital expenditure associated with the supply and installation of CCTV was funded through Home Office grants.

4.1.2 Associated running costs (salaries and maintenance of the system) are not funded through the Home Office grants. The review sought to identify / confirm the ways in which these are funded and the findings are detailed below.

4.2 Maintenance and Repairs

Area of Expenditure	01/02 Actual	02/03 Actual	03/04 Actual	04/05 (Budget)
Maintenance and Repairs	76k	148k	170k	162k
Insurance	11k	11k	21k	21k
Salaries	100k	100k	107k	110k
Total Expenditure	187k	259k	298k	293k

4.2.1 Expenditure incurred on maintenance and repairs during 2003/04 has been further interrogated and identified that expenditure on repairs and maintenance varied widely between areas / schemes. Due to the variances in

this one financial year, the previous year figures (2002/03) were examined in more detail to determine whether any pattern existed.

4.2.2 The variances had a number of contributing factors. Spending on repairs and maintenance tended to be high in the older schemes where there had been no renewal of the equipment, for example Atherton and Golborne. Some of the newer schemes were still under warranty and so incurred less repair and maintenance charges. In some cases, replacement of equipment had been coded as repairs and maintenance.

4.2.3 The reason given for the significant increase in 2003/04 for insurance charges to the CCTV Section is the increased value of camera stock.

4.2.4 Salaries are currently funded through the Neighbourhood Renewal Fund (NRF). Actual salary costs inclusive of enhancements and overtime was obtained and the Select Committee was satisfied that they are adequately covered by the grant received. However, funding from this source is only available until 31st March 2008 before which time other sources of funding will need to be identified.

4.3 Growth Bid

4.3.1 A growth bid of £75,000 per annum was submitted in September 2003 for the financial year 2004/05. This bid looked at increasing staffing to enhance the existing service, taking it back to the quality of service achieved in previous years. This view was based on the fact that there had been a significant increase in the number of images being monitored without a corresponding increase in the number of CCTV Operators to monitor them. Specifically, images, or camera numbers, had increased from 240 in 2001 to 520 in 2004. However, the cameras at Scholes Village, as part of the Concierge Scheme, and Miry Lane are only monitored on demand. These total 124 in number.

The bid was unsuccessful.

4.3.2 The implications of this were reported to Community Safety Panel in February 2004. At this time, two options were proposed, viz.:

- To keep staffing levels the same but with an expectation that the service would deteriorate due to the increasing workloads generally and new areas of work being introduced.
- Reduce the monitoring hours by 23% with the same numbers of staff. This was considered by the officers to maintain the effectiveness during the hours monitored but reduce the overall effectiveness for the hours not monitored.

4.3.3 During the course of the review, the opinion has also been expressed by representatives of Greater Manchester Police that monitored hours are most effective if based around the National Intelligence Model (NIM). This will be discussed in paragraph 6.5.

In summary, the cost to the Council of providing this service has increased since its introduction and this is expected to continue, even if the current levels of service remain the same. There appears to be a clear need to determine the monitoring hours required for it to remain effective without increased salary costs. Finding replacement funding to cover salaries, upon the expiration of the Neighbourhood Renewal Fund, was not within the remit of this review but failure to do so will significantly affect the effectiveness of the service.

5. Objective 2.

To identify beneficiaries of and financial contributors to the service.

5.1 Approach

5.1.1 The consultation process identified a number of beneficiaries of the CCTV service. Not all of the stakeholders would be expected to make a specific financial contribution and some beneficiaries may be unaware that they are even receiving such a benefit, like the public.

5.1.2 Discussions with the CCTV management and examination of copy log sheets covering a few “typical” days identified a number of stakeholders shown below together with any contributions, financial or otherwise, they may make.

5.2 Pub Watch / Shop Watch

5.2.1 These two separate schemes are run by officers of the Council but owned by the members of the schemes. They currently cover businesses and leisure premises within Wigan town centre only.

5.2.2 The main aims of the schemes are to improve the prevention and detection of crime, reduce the opportunity to commit crime, the apprehension and prosecution of offenders, create a safe and secure environment for staff and customers, target most persistent criminals and in doing so will reduce losses to members. The review noted that these reflect the aims of the CCTV service.

5.2.3 The basic elements of the schemes that members benefit from are:

- A forum for members to discuss issues specific to them and Wigan town centre

- A source of practical advice on issues of crime
- To be part of a radio network which includes all members, Wigan Town Centre Manager and the CCTV Control Room. (Members purchase or rent their own radios.)
- To have direct contact with the CCTV Control Room

5.2.4 Of particular interest to this review is the logo that is used by the schemes which clearly shows a CCTV camera and a radio. Are the schemes suggesting that both these pieces of equipment, working together, are key to a successful scheme?

5.2.5 In judging the effectiveness or otherwise of CCTV in Wigan, the take up of schemes like Shop Watch and Pub Watch could be considered.

5.3 Shop Watch

5.3.1 The take up of this scheme is around 30% currently but this is calculated on all business premises within the town centre. It is recognised that some businesses would clearly not benefit from being members of the scheme or contribute practically to the scheme, for example insurance company offices and dental surgeries.

5.3.2 The potential take up is considered by the Town Centre Manager to be almost at its optimum. The annual subscription is currently £95 per year and this money is held by the Council but the members of the scheme manage expenditure.

5.3.3 Anecdotal evidence suggests that retail chains pay differing rates and receive different service levels for CCTV monitoring dependent on the borough. Wigan is seen as well below the average subscription and above average service.

5.4 Pub Watch

5.4.1 Currently, all pubs in Wigan town centre are voluntarily members of Pub Watch. The annual subscription is currently £50 per year (less than £1 per week) and this money is held in a separate bank account and expenditure is managed by the membership.

5.4.2 No direct financial contributions to the CCTV scheme have been identified from the pub/shop watch schemes as part of the review. However, the schemes may use the annual subscriptions to purchase and install additional CCTV cameras for the town centre though this impacts on the Control Room staff.

5.5 Greater Manchester Police (Wigan and Leigh Divisions)

5.5.1 Greater Manchester Police have been identified as an organisation that benefits significantly from the provision of the service. The review identified the following benefits to the police:

- Detecting and reporting of crime. This occurs through live monitoring and post incident through tape reviews.
- Co-ordination of police resources. This occurs during an incident where CCTV Control Room staff directs police to an incident or locates an offender on their behalf.
- CCTV control room officer time and expertise.
- Evidence gathering by way of copying tapes and real time monitoring.
- Special operations (Swift Rapid Deployment Cameras).

5.6 Greater Manchester Police Contributions

5.6.1 Officer Time

If a police officer is unfit to fulfil his/her normal duties (an example being the individual is on recuperative duties) then he/she is appointed to the CCTV Control Room to assist in detecting and reporting crime. Unfortunately, this agreement is on an ad-hoc basis and there is no guarantee that an officer will be in attendance during any particular period of time. The review identified, by way of consulting with CCTV Control Room staff, that when an officer is in attendance the quality of service provision is enhanced due to a police radio being available. The issue of police radios is detailed in paragraph 7.2.

5.7 Financial Contribution

5.7.1 A financial contribution is received from the police when the CCTV Control Room provides Swift Rapid Deployment Cameras at “high risk” football and rugby matches at the JJB Stadium. This service is part of the package provided by the police and contact with the staff at the JJB Stadium is via the police.

5.7.2 As part of the review, the costs, to the CCTV Control Room, of providing this type of service to a specific event were determined. The football match took place on the 9th May 2004 between Wigan Athletic and West Ham United and is likely to recur with each “high profile” match.

	£
Engineering costs	£250
Directly attributable staff costs	£160
Total costs	£410
Less amount recharged to the Police	(£250)
Cost to the Council on this one event	£160

5.8 Miry Lane businesses

5.8.1 Fourteen CCTV cameras were located around the Miry Lane Industrial Estate by the Council in the early 1990's funded through a City Challenge project. There were high levels of crime affecting businesses in that area. The City Challenge team organised a payment arrangement with the businesses and transferred this function to the Council after the first year. No financial contributions were received to cover associated running costs after this first year. From research, it appears the CCTV Section did not pursue payments from associated businesses.

5.8.2 During the review, the area was visited and the following points were noted at that time:

- There are number of signs in the area, which clearly state that CCTV is in operation, and that the Council monitors it.
- Many of the businesses located in the area had made their own CCTV arrangements for around their own premises. It was evident that cameras were targeted on locations that may have been more desirable to the businesses.

5.8.3 Since visiting the area, it has been established that these cameras now record on a 24-hour basis and are **not** actively monitored by the officers in the CCTV Control Room.

5.9 Solicitors on Behalf of Clients

5.9.1 Solicitors request CCTV footage from the Control Room in order to assist their client's cases. There were approximately 150 such requests in 2003/04. The CCTV Manager responds to each request, outlining the retrieval fee that will be charged, at £30 per hour officer time (minimum £10 per request). It needs to be

noted that not all requests result in work beyond the initial response, or indeed income, to the CCTV Section.

5.10 Individuals who live, work or visit the borough

5.10.1 The review identified various examples where CCTV provision has assisted the general public whom live, visit or work in the borough where CCTV is in operation. Examples of this are:

- The detection of known criminals seen in the area who are monitored to ensure they do not commit offences against the public.
- The detection of individuals serving Anti Social Behaviour Orders who are detected within their exclusion zone.
- Early identification of disorder that can be dealt with before the public becomes aware of it.

5.11 Council Buildings

5.11.1 Although Council owned / occupied buildings in town centres may be covered by CCTV, discussions with the Council's Insurance Officer confirmed that CCTV monitoring does not reduce insurance premiums due to the excess amounts on claims.

5.12 Wigan Bus Station (GMPTE)

5.12.1 CCTV was originally installed by GMPTE at their own expense and at their request, the cameras were linked to the Council's Control Room for monitoring purposes. For providing this service, the Council receives an annual income of approximately £6,000 that increases annually in line with inflation.

In summary, there are numerous beneficiaries of the service but few make any specific financial contribution. The public is generally unaware that they are receiving this service. Where contributions are received, this is not linked to the actual cost being incurred. A summarised list of beneficiaries and contributors are listed below.

BENEFICIARY	DIRECT CONTRIBUTION RECEIVED
Shop Watch	No
Pub Watch	No
Greater Manchester Police	Officer Time (ad-hoc) and contribution of £250 per high profile match at JJB Stadium. £4k this year for support costs received on a ad-hoc basis.
Miry Lane Businesses	No
Solicitors on behalf of clients	£30 per hour officer time. Minimum of £10 per request On demand.
General Public	No
Council Buildings	No
Wigan Bus Station	£6,000 per annum.

Given the above, it is recommended that each area be reviewed with a view to determining a more equitable contribution relative to benefit.

6. Objective 3.

To understand the extent of CCTV coverage and occurrence of crime by type and frequency within the borough.

6.1 Approach

6.1.1 The CCTV scheme covers predominantly town centre locations and a full list of coverage, together with the number of cameras at each location, was obtained to inform the review. This information is detailed at Appendix 1.

6.1.2 Crime statistics for the borough, 2002/2003 and 2003/2004, were examined to identify any changes over that period.

6.1.3 The extent of current monitoring in hours was also requested as part of the review.

6.2 Camera Locations

6.2.1 Cameras in the main are located around town centres with the notable exceptions of Miry Lane (Industrial), Borsdane Avenue, Scholes Village and Norley Hall (Residential).

6.2.2 The locations of these cameras will affect the type of crimes that are detected. Simplistically, you will not identify a house burglary in retail areas.

6.3 Police statistics

6.3.1 The Police supplied data relating to crimes committed within ward areas but these do not coincide with the relatively small areas covered by CCTV cameras.

There is, however, data relating to town centre crime levels for 2002/03 compared with 2003/04. This was supplied by Wigan and Leigh Community Safety Partnership and is presented below.

Town	Crime in 2002/03	Crime in 2003/04	% Change
Ashton	235	241	3
Atherton	231	178	-23
Golborne	127	84	-34
Hindley	233	212	-9
Ince	23	24	4
Leigh	855	854	0
Pemberton	137	149	9
Platt Bridge	51	83	63
Standish	52	73	40
Tyldesley	111	77	-31
Wigan	2144	1906	-11

6.3.2 The crime statistics include a variety of activities that includes criminal damage, shoplifting, and disturbance in street, theft, and sexual crimes and less serious wounding. It should be borne in mind that the reduction in statistics are not directly attributable to CCTV alone but interestingly criminal activity around the locations of CCTV have reduced over the two year period. The big percentage increases have occurred in areas where CCTV has not been installed.

6.4 Monitoring times

6.4.1 The review has identified earlier the unsuccessful growth bid and the implications resulting from this. Since this time, the CCTV Control Room has continued to operate the same number of hours as described (130 hours per week). However, the growth bid reported that there would be deterioration in effectiveness but, based on the performance results shown at 6.3.1 and the statistics reported on page 29 of this report, there is no evidence to support this in the short term. Although 2 temporary officers were employed during this period. Considering CCTV is a contributory factor in reducing crime, the statistics highlight that crime is reducing in town centre locations.

6.4.2 Although the review has not specifically sought the views of the general public to inform the review process, previous consultation has been considered. Consultation with the Citizen's Panel and anecdotal evidence obtained during the review identified the following:

- the public don't believe the cameras are switched on
- some police officers don't realise the cameras are monitored
- a perception that the cameras are not pointing in right direction
- the public believes that the cameras have no film in them.

6.5 Monitoring Times - National Intelligence Model (NIM)

6.5.1 During the discussions that took place with the Police, there was a suggestion that a reduction in monitoring hours is not considered a problem provided that the key times are covered. The key times are those when it is most likely that crimes will be committed. In town centres, this includes day and night time coverage.

6.5.2 The National Intelligence Model (NIM) is a model for policing that ensures information is fully researched, developed and analysed to provide intelligence that can be used to:

- provide strategic direction
- make tactical resourcing decisions about operational policing and,
- manage risk.

6.5.3 The NIM is primarily a business model for use in allocating police resources. However, there should be strong links between the NIM and partnership working.

6.5.4 Partners, in this case Wigan Council's CCTV Control Room, are encouraged to provide information to the beginning of the process and accept the results after research and analysis, in order that they can be better informed in relation to the strategic issues or assist in tactical resolutions. An example here would be matching monitoring times to policing needs.

6.5.5 With this in mind, the Select Committee requested up to date information from the police regarding the timings and frequency of crime around the areas of CCTV provision. This would enable consideration for demand led shifts within the CCTV Control Room. The requested information from the Police is contained in a confidential document titled Tactical Assessment. This information is not open for viewing outside a police environment but should be considered by partners when determining shift patterns. What should be noted at this point is that the needs of CCTV monitoring will change dependent on the area in which CCTV is installed and the ongoing information from the Tactical Assessment document. Partnership working will be critical in this regard.

6.5.6 Currently, the police use the Tactical Assessment document in determining shift patterns for their officers.

In summary, the cameras have been primarily located around town centres where they are useful to both the day and night environments. They have also been used to target hot spot areas. Throughout the review, there is the suggestion that **time related** hot spots, rather than **geographical** hot spots become the focus of attention. Unfortunately, it is difficult to draw conclusions on the type and frequency of crime because of the confidentiality of the Tactical Assessment Document.

7. Objective 4

To examine existing key processes and evaluate their effectiveness both internally and externally.

7.1 Approach

7.1.1 One purpose of consultation with a number of stakeholders was to identify where current processes may be adversely affecting the effectiveness of CCTV in the borough with a view to recommending actions for improvement. The stakeholders considered to be providing most insight in this area were the officers attached to the CCTV Control Room and the representatives of the Police.

7.1.2 The areas that have caused most concern to the Select Committee and have therefore been pursued as part of the review are as follows:

- Communications (Police Radio).
- Awareness of the Police.
- Evidence Gathering.
- Performance Management Issues.

7.2 Communications (Police Radio)

7.2.1 It is the view of the officers who work in the CCTV Control Room that they could be more effective if they had direct contact with Police Officers “on the street”. Previously, they were able to do this as they had access to a Police radio within the secure environment of the Control Room. This is no longer available for their use unless a Police Officer is in the Control Room.

7.2.2 A number of explanations have been put forward to explain why a Police radio cannot be used by the CCTV Control Room staff without the presence of a Police Officer. They include:

- The staff in the Control Room are not vetted by the Police force
- The current radios in use are valuable to criminals due to the access to information this would provide and must be safely guarded.
- The radio handsets were previously owned by the Police force so could be lent out to whomever they chose. The new Airwave system is now in use and the licensing arrangement dictates that only licence holders can use the system. In this case, the licence holder is Greater Manchester Police.

7.2.3 We contacted other Councils within Greater Manchester to establish, amongst other things, whether the civilian officers had access to a police radio. The main findings were:

- Those that did have access to a radio, only did so when a police officer was present.
- Police officer(s) were guaranteed to be present in a couple of the Councils at identified “busy hours”, i.e. Friday and Saturday evenings. This was not dependent on police officers being on recuperative duty.
- There are two police officers on duty within the CCTV Control Room at Manchester City Council, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week. Therefore, a radio is available via the police officer.

7.2.4 It became evident that other Control Rooms within Greater Manchester do not have access to a police radio without a police officer being present, but several did have guaranteed police presence during prescribed hours.

7.2.5 The review also identified that Darlington Council CCTV Control Room staff use police radios. This was introduced in partnership with Durham (Northants) Constabulary and a service level agreement is currently in existence.

7.2.6 However, the police within Wigan are now considering using special constables, or a voluntary scheme that would allow individuals to work within the CCTV Control Room giving radio access. Another consideration, proposed by the police, is that the CCTV Control Room staff could be classed as volunteers to the police. This would allow a police radio to be held in the Control Room. However, consideration would need to be given to housing these officers within the Control Room.

7.3 Police Awareness

7.3.1 There are good working relationships between the beat officer for Wigan Town Centre and the Control Room. This may be, in part, as a result of the proximity of the beat area to the Control Room.

7.3.2 Anecdotal evidence suggests that this type of relationship is not typical across the borough and that there is a distinct lack of awareness of the benefits of the CCTV Control Room from other officers located around the borough.

7.3.3 It was also reported that the issue of police travelling to the Control Room to view CCTV footage from the outskirts of the borough is seen by some as a waste of valuable police time.

7.4 Evidence Champion (within G.M.P.).

7.4.1 The police have recently commenced a pilot scheme within Wigan to understand if there are benefits in the permanent introduction of an Evidence Champion.

7.4.2 This individual views CCTV footage where incidents have occurred but the offender was not apprehended. A decision is then made as to whether the incident crosses the threshold that the police consider is worthy of pressing charges on an individual. The officer will also assess whether the footage can be used as evidence at a later date.

7.4.3 The Evidence Champion is currently based at Ince Police Station in a computer editing suite funded by Greater Manchester Police. The Council provided some of the computer equipment.

7.4.4 Qualitative data will be gathered by GMP to evaluate this project to determine its' long term viability. Such data is currently unavailable.

7.5 Previous Evaluation of CCTV Service

7.5.1 During the course of the review, it came to the attention of the Select Committee that an evaluation of the CCTV Monitoring Scheme had taken place in December 1999 and March / April 2000. The resulting reports were considered as part of this review.

7.5.2 The purpose of the two reports differed from the current exercise in that its purpose was not to identify the effectiveness or otherwise of CCTV. However, it was intended, like this review, *“to identify strengths and weaknesses of the initiativeand the viability of introducing monitoring to town centre locations within the borough of Wigan.”*

The original report (December 1999) made several recommendations that would “*maximise the performance of the second pilot Scheme and provide long term guidance*”

The Policy Officer holds copies of these reports.

7.5.3 We examined the recommendations that were **not** implemented in time for the second review in March / April 2000 to identify whether they had subsequently been implemented. From the 13 recommendations originally identified 11 have now been progressed and 2 are still relevant yet have not been implemented (see Action Plan 3.2).

7.6 Performance Management Issues

7.6.1 During the course of the review, performance data relating to the service was requested. The type of information that is reported to the Community Safety Panel covers:

- Number of incidents recorded and dealt with by the CCTV Operators
- Number of CCTV tapes viewed and released for evidential purposes
- Number of incidents with a Police FWIN (Force Wide Incident Number)
- Number of incidents with an arrest
- Proportion of time spent on monitoring (and other duties)

7.6.2 The most recent information available is up to the end of March 2003.

In July 2003, the performance for the previous year showed that the number of incidents reported by the CCTV Control Room had increased, but as importantly, the proportion receiving a FWIN or that led to an arrest also increased. This would indicate that the operators are identifying serious incidents and suggest improved effectiveness. The following table presents the statistical information.

Activity	2001/02	2002/03	% increase
Incidents recorded	1,463	1,916	31
Incidents with Police FWIN	445	845	90
Incidents resulting in an arrest	154	279	80

7.6.3 However, it was a matter of concern to the review that this information was not easily available other than for inclusion within the annual report and that the statistics for 2003/2004 had still not yet been produced in October 2004.

7.6.4 There was also much anecdotal evidence that CCTV was a key element in securing some convictions. However, it was not possible for us to see if the link between the courts, the police and the CCTV Control Room was working effectively as actual data was not available to this review.

7.6.5 There is, however, information in the form of newspaper articles that was made available to the review and the following are examples that show how CCTV footage has been used in court, or pre-court, cases.

- *A woman owns up to making a false allegation of rape when CCTV footage shows the accused catching a taxi with three other people.*
- *The police place CCTV images relating to a crime in Wigan in a Liverpool newspaper to try and identify the offenders, where the suspects had Liverpool accents.*
- *Attack thugs caught on camera; three men caught and subsequently jailed for attacking two men in Hindley Town Centre.*

7.6.6 These examples are in relation to very serious crimes. Home Office Research Study 217 (2000) "The Economic and Social Costs of Crime" has estimated, amongst other things, the costs of investigation for different types of crime. For a sexual assault, the approximate cost is in the region of £19,000 (2000 statistics). In the first example, the costs were minimised due to bringing the investigation to an early closure. The "victim" could no longer pursue the accusation with the CCTV evidence available. In the second example, the objective is to identify the offenders, again saving the costs of investigation by bringing it to an earlier conclusion. The third example presented the court with CCTV footage that assisted in securing a conviction.

In summary, it is considered that police presence and/or police radio in the Control Room should be pursued to improve the current service together with awareness raising for police officers. Identifying effectiveness of CCTV has been difficult to demonstrate and the absence of a formalised performance reporting system for 2003/2004 has proved to be a hindrance. However, prior to financial year 2003/2004 evidence shows improved effectiveness.

8. Objective 5.

To identify good practice wherever it may exist.

8.1 Approach

8.1.1 As part of the review, visits have been made to the CCTV Control Room of the Concierge Scheme operated by Wigan and Leigh Housing Ltd and the CCTV Control Room based in Manchester City Centre.

8.1.2 In addition, a number of stakeholders have also been consulted, as part of the review process to identify perceived good practice. The view, in particular of the police, is that the operation in Wigan is of a very high quality.

8.1.3 The review conducted some research that included the Home Office website from which good practice was identified.

8.2 Concierge Scheme (WALH)

8.2.1 Members and officers of the Select Committee, together with members and officers of the CCTV Working Group, conducted a joint visit to the Concierge Scheme Control Room. This visit was arranged in order that direct comparison could be made between the two operations. These are listed overleaf in 8.3.2.

8.2.2 The over-riding priority for employees in the Concierge Scheme is the safety and welfare of the tenants in the area covered. Their duties are far wider than monitoring CCTV footage. The job descriptions reflect this.

8.3 Manchester City Centre Control Room

8.3.1 This Control Room was described in the March 2004 edition of Brief (Greater Manchester Police internal newspaper) as “...one of the most advanced CCTV control centres in Europe.” After speaking at the World Summit of Cities and Local Authorities on the Information Society, PC Mark Brown stated that “As far as CCTV is concerned, it was clear that Manchester leads the way.”

The Policy Officer on behalf of the Select Committee undertook a visit on 18th May 2004 to Manchester City Centre Control Room.

8.3.2 The following table identifies the differences within each scheme in tabular form.

	Wigan’s CCTV Control Room	Manchester CCTV Control Room	Wigan & Leigh Housing Concierge Scheme
Number of cameras monitored	400 (excluding Concierge Scheme)	117	120
Monitored Hours + staffing	130 hours/ 4 staff	24/7 and 4 staff each shift	24/7 and 2 staff each shift.
Initial Investment Source	Home Office CCTV Grants	Home Office CCTV Grants/NCP Partnership.	Home Office CCTV Grants
Funding for maintenance/repair	Revenue Expenditure	Revenue Expenditure	Tenants covered by the scheme
Funding for salaries	Neighbourhood Renewal Scheme (until 2008)	Revenue Expenditure and NCP Partnership	Tenants covered by the scheme.
Police within Control Room	Only when on recuperative duties	24/7	Not Applicable
Police radio within Control room	Only when police Officer present	24/7	Not Applicable
Links to Pub/Shop Watch Schemes	Yes	Yes	Not Applicable

8.4 Home Office Website

8.4.1 Section 5 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 *“places a statutory responsibility on the police, local authorities..... for crime reduction working in partnership with other key local partners in the public, private and voluntary sectors, as the lead members of responsible authority groups.”*

8.4.2 The Home Office produced a document in April 2004 entitled “Violent Crime: Tackling Violent Crime in the night-time Economy” which sets out guidelines and tactical options. The authors of the document had requested examples of good practice that were working from around the country. It specifically makes references to the use of CCTV, but more importantly the effective use of CCTV. The following are taken from that document.

8.5 Interventions

- *“CCTV – fixed at strategic locations. Consider deployment of a member of police staff or a police officer to local authority / contracted CCTV control rooms at peak times to assist in directing resources, or create a direct link to Police CCTV control rooms, by image and police radio network.”*
Wigan only fulfils the placing of CCTV at strategic locations.
- *CCTV – Mobile systems. With permanent stanchions put in place to receive operational mobile CCTV units, in order to effectively respond to any displacement of criminal acts caused by fixed CCTV. **Wigan has mobile systems available but no fixed stanchions.***
- *A combination of high profile patrols, CCTV and improved lighting along specific routes out of an area could create a “safe route”, which should be well marketed. **Wigan has specific routes out of Wigan Town Centre but they are not well marketed.***

- *Night Net Radio / paging systems for all pubs within close proximity or in areas of licensed premises saturation. These systems should be directly linked to the police. This enables the passage of real time information regarding ongoing problems or troublemakers likely to warrant police response prior to any escalation or where it is likely to impact on neighbouring premises. Available in Wigan Town Centre only via CCTV Control Room, not direct to Police. Police presence in the control room would help to address this.*

Location

- *A capable guardian is anything, either a person or thing that discourages crime from taking place. These can be formal or informal. Some examples of capable guardians include Police patrols, Door staff, Lighting, CCTV systems. All guardians evident in Wigan and Leigh Town Centres.*

8.6 Home Office Research

8.6.1 In 2003 the Home Office commissioned a piece of research into the effectiveness of CCTV. The review team contacted one of the researchers and established that Leigh Town Centre is included within the research and that the results will be reported to the Home Office in the autumn of 2004. The results, therefore, are not available for inclusion in this report but should be considered on publication.

In summary, the WALH Concierge Scheme has different objectives to those of the CCTV Control Room, making a joint operation unlikely. Manchester City Centre CCTV Control Room is a particularly good example of partnership working both to obtain funding and human resources.

The Home Office has invested significant funds into CCTV over the past few years and this report reflects this. CCTV is obviously viewed as one effective tool to reduce crime and disorder.

Wigan strives in achieving the interventions and location criteria identified in the Home Office Website document "Violent Crime: Tackling Violent Crime in the nighttime Economy". However, there is still some further work to be undertaken before Wigan reflects the good practice identified in this document.

Conclusions

Resulting from the findings the Select Committee are able to conclude that:

- Police presence and/or radio would improve the effectiveness of CCTV within Wigan Borough.
- The financial burden of operating the CCTV system is borne disproportionately by the Council. Other beneficiaries should contribute to the service.
- Awareness training for the police would improve effectiveness. The Evidence Champion is an early example of this, others need to follow from discussions with the police.
- Public awareness- Would improve effectiveness but more as a deterrent.
- Go for quality, not quantity. This covers targeting, monitoring and increasing numbers of cameras based on needs of the service.
- The costs of continuing the service are likely to increase, possibly higher than inflation due to the age of the stock. Can future capital funding streams be identified that would contribute towards the replacement of older stock?
- The determination of optimum monitoring hours, identified through partner involvement, will assist in minimising costs and maximising effectiveness.
- Pub/Shop Watch Schemes receive an excellent service at little cost and must contribute more financially.
- Regular performance management information would clearly benefit the monitoring of effectiveness.

RECOMMENDATIONS

R1. Enhance partnership working. Although there are good relationships with the Police, this review has identified that the systems and processes in place could be further improved to directly impact on the effectiveness of the CCTV service. It is recommended that there is continued joint working to complete the tasks identified within the Action Plan. These discussions to include arrangements to secure guaranteed police presence in the Control Room during hours of greatest need.

R2. Develop a Business Plan, which reviews existing and future funding sources of income. Develop a clear criterion for expansion, which is properly communicated to major stakeholders. This will include the examination of proposals that the shop/pub watch community contribute together with greater resource input from the police.

R3. Further development of the performance management system to both evidence effectiveness and to assist the business planning process. The performance management framework in place needs to be developed further in order that it can provide accurate and timely information about effectiveness and will assist in future business planning activity.

R4. Increase public awareness of the existence and effectiveness of CCTV in the borough. This will lead to an added sense of security to the public and act as a deterrent to the criminal fraternity.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

1. Although there are good relationships with the police, this review has identified that the systems and processes in place could be further improved to directly impact on the effectiveness of the CCTV service. It is recommended that there is continued joint working to complete the tasks identified within this table.

Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
1.1 A working group to be established specifically to address the issue of police officer presence in the Control Room, utilising the Tactical Assessment document.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager to arrange. • Representatives from both the Council and the Police to be part of this group. 		April 2005	July 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To be beneficial to both the Council and the Police • Increased police presence in the Control room (based on high demand times, not availability). • Greater access to a police radio (Time)
1.2 Organise CCTV Awareness training for police officers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • Liaison Officer (GMP) 		May 2005	Ongoing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continual process to include new police recruits • Inclusion of Special police officers may encourage them to volunteer to work in the Control Room.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
<p>1.3 Develop an SLA between the Council and the police which will also reflect the changes resulting from tasks 1.1 and 1.2.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • Liaison Officer (GMP) 		<p style="text-align: center;">July 2005</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">November 2005</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formalises agreements and expectations of all parties. • Based on the agreement between Darlington Council and Durham Constabulary • To be reported to the Community Safety Panel on completion.
<p>1.4 An exercise to be undertaken to assess the viability of identifying and reporting the links between CCTV evidence and court convictions.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • Liaison Officer (GMP) 		<p style="text-align: center;">April 2005</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Ongoing</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If the data is readily available, it must be incorporated into the performance management framework and reported on. • Outcome can be used as part of the Awareness Training for the police (1.2) and increasing public awareness (4)

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

2. A Business Plan to be produced and monitored. The following tasks to be included within the plan.					
Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
2.1 Propose an annual contribution from the pub/shop watch schemes and Miry Lane businesses (rather than individual members) to the CCTV Section.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Town Centre Manager • Service Manager 		March 2005	June 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Raise awareness with members of the schemes of the costs of providing the service and the benefits received. • Although additional income may not directly affect the effectiveness, it could assist with paying for monitoring as opposed to recorded hours.
2.2 Develop and implement a clear criterion for purchase of additional cameras both by the Council and external organisations where the Council will be asked to monitor e.g. pub/shop watch schemes, residents associations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • GMP representative • Town Centre Manager • WALH representative • Police • Community Safety Section 		June 2005	October 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Future costs to cover maintenance, repair and replacement plus staffing costs must all be considered prior to purchase. • Consideration to be given to alternatives, i.e. mobile cameras, dummy units.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
2.3 Identify and report separately on repairs and replacement costs associated with cameras over the individual schemes.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • Finance Officers (Security Section) 		December 2004	Ongoing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To commence in December but with useful information from 2005/06. • Identification of poorly sited cameras or unsuitable stock • Encourage planned replacement programmes • Obsolete equipment to be written off/replaced.
2.4 Identify future funding streams required to meet the staffing costs with effect from 2008.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Treasurer • Service Manager • Community Safety Panel 		January 2005	March 2008	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Continuation of the service. • Staffing stability • Regular progress reports to the Community Safety Panel

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

3. The performance management framework in place needs to be developed further in order that it can provide accurate and timely management information about effectiveness and will assist in future business planning activity.					
Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
3.1 Identify crimes that would be prevented or detected via CCTV.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • Liaison Officer (GMP) 		April 2005	April 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence in the future of the effectiveness of CCTV • To be a part of the performance management framework.
3.2 Complete the implementation of the improvement plan from the previous evaluation of the CCTV Monitoring Scheme (March/April 2000).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager. 		June 2005	November 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improve overall service provision. • To be reported to the Community Safety Panel.
3.3 A review to be completed of the existing measures and how they link into the objectives of the service.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager. • Performance Team (CE) 		March 2005	March 2005	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allows the monitoring of the effectiveness of the service • Performance data must be reported on a regular basis. Ideally, quarterly. • Review the current data collection methods used.
3.4 If appropriate, new measures introduced to reflect the objectives of the service.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager. • Performance Team (CE) 		March 2005	March 2005	

RECOMMENDATIONS AND ACTION PLAN

4. Increase public awareness of the existence and effectiveness of CCTV in the borough.					
Task	Responsible organisation and officer	Agreed during the review?	Start date	End date	Comments / Anticipated Outcomes
<p>4.1 Increase public awareness. This can be done in a number of ways but could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of Borough Life. • Use of weekly “caught on CCTV” in local press. • Press releases. • Live CCTV Screen in Wigan and Leigh Town Centres. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service Manager • GMP. • Local Press • Public Relations Officer (CE) • Legal Services. 		Jan 2005	Ongoing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will raise awareness of the public and the criminal fraternity.